

Newspaper portrayal and legislative voting process: A case study of statutory minimum wage in Hong Kong

WONG Ngai-chiu¹
Lingnan University, Hong Kong

Introduction

Motions on Minimum Wage were first introduced to Legislative Council (LegCo) on 28 April 1999, and the third reading of the bill was passed on 17 July 2010. During the above period of time, the pro-labor lawmakers made an attempt to persuade other lawmakers towards consensus on the issue through those motions. In the pre- and post-legislation periods, scholars have paid attention to the issue of Statutory Minimum Wage² (SMW). They had made an attempt to explain how and why the SMW was legislated for in the post-colonial era (from 1998 to 2010) of Hong Kong. They had argued that the growing public demand created huge pressure for policy-makers³. Even though these previous studies provided explanations of how the policy was made, they had failed to answer to two fundamental questions clearly. They are: how LegCo members recognized of the need to vote in favor of the motion on SMW and why they changed their voting positions in different times.

By studying newspapers' portrayals, this paper tries to answer the above questions. Newspapers are one major form of mass media that not only provide us with information but also embrace values in texts⁴. According to Entman and Kim's studies, newspapers reflect society members' opinion and the latest information about the society through their articles and they also lead their audiences' attention to certain areas by using different types of frames and connotations. In other words, newspaper audiences read the information presented by the print news while simultaneously being exposed to particular values inserted within news reports. Hence, they concluded that readers' understanding about society and their voting positions on

¹ The Author is in the final year of his MPhil degree study and his email address is: chiude0814@hotmail.com

² SMW is a legislation to help the working poor and the under-paid workers of Hong Kong. In general, 4 motions on SMW have been discussed by the lawmakers in the post-colonial period of Hong Kong.

³ Yew, C. P. (2013). The road to a statutory minimum wage: Lessons and implications. In Y. N. Zheng (Ed.), *Hong Kong under Chinese rule* (pp.151-164). Singapore: Economic integration and political world scientific publishing company.

⁴ Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing: Toward Clarification of a fractured paradigm. *Journal of Communication*, 43(4), 51-58; Kim, W. C. (1994). Newspaper influence on health policy development. *Newspaper Research Journal*, 15(3), 1-11.

social issues might be subject to change. Besides the above western studies, indeed, scholars in Hong Kong pointed out that newspapers might affect readers' positions in the case. Recently, Wong and Chan studied that how newspaper reports might affect readers' positions in Hong Kong's political reform of universal suffrage⁵. Their research findings stated that newspaper reports not only provided the information about political reform to readers, but reports might also shape readers' positions in that whether they should support the government proposal. This was because, according to their research, newspaper reports were framed with particular connotation that might change readers' perception on the case. Hence, reader's positions in the government proposal might be affected. For example, according to their research, people who majorly accessed to Apple Daily to gathering information about the political reform had a higher intention to veto the government proposal, while compared with other people who majorly accessed to other newspapers to grab information. With regard to SMW, then, in order to understand what information newspapers portrayed, and how the artifact information might tell politicians about the problem of working poor and might influence over politicians' voting actions to the case.

The purpose of this paper is to gain a better understanding of newspaper portrayals of social issues and the interaction between newspaper portrayals and lawmakers' voting behavior. The term "voting behavior" is used to describe that how and why lawmakers chose particular positions while voting. The case of Statutory Minimum Wage has been selected to explain the relationship. This is a study based on the nature of artifact information about SMW collected from daily newspapers in Hong Kong.

Analytical Framework

The procedure is divided into three sections. Firstly, how newspapers portrayed SMW in post-colonial Hong Kong is studied. The paper divides newspaper articles into four categories: positive, negative, neutral, and others. These categories are designed to code and to study the newspapers' portrayals of SMW in Hong Kong. Particularly, an attempt is made to identify the role of newspapers in affecting lawmakers' voting actions to SMW. An assumption is made that newspapers successfully attract and maintain lawmakers' attention to the case by using different types of themes to report SMW in different periods of time. Hence, lawmakers might recognize the

⁵ Wong, W. H. and Chan, S. H. (2015, January 17). You are what you read. Information gap affects Hong Kong political positions. *Ming Pao Daily News*, p. A28.

problem of working poor and the needs for the legislation of SMW. In fact, newspapers were one of the important channels affecting lawmakers about the voting positions for policy-change in the community⁶. Those studies explained that, on the one hand lawmakers had limited time and resources and hence it was not possible for them to take care of every social demand, while on the other the reports made by the newspapers showed the magnitude of the social issues and the need for policy-change. Hence, the newspapers reports were one of the important factors lawmakers took into account when considering the selection of voting positions for policy-change.

Secondly, the two major political parties' voting positions in SMW are studied. Particularly, attention is paid to why the political parties changed their positions from negative or neutral to positive attitudes towards SMW - studying the major consideration of each political party regarding the legislation of SMW. Hence, it is illustrated why each political party changed their positions towards SMW at different time. In the previous studies on SMW, scholars pointed out that public demand was a critical factor affecting lawmakers' positions in the case. They also pointed out that political parties worried that whether the introduction of SMW would have negative impacts on the operation of the market⁷. However, their arguments were not convincing. First, if the major public positions in SMW was the critical factor, why each political party changed its positions in the case in different time? Secondly, both "the market" and "the operation of the market" were confusing terms. These terms did not articulate political parties' consideration for the legislation of SMW. In order to gain a better understanding about why political parties changed their positions in the legislation of SMW, and how political parties thought about the relationship between the market and SMW, the following assumptions are developed: political parties in Hong Kong have their own consideration for SMW. For example, the paper assumes that Democratic Party (DP) mostly considers whether the introduction of SMW would improve the low-skilled labor's protection against deprivation of low-skilled workers. And the Liberal Party (LP) mostly pays attention to whether the introduction of SMW would affect the economic growth in Hong Kong.

Thirdly, an attempt is made to study the relationship between newspaper reports and lawmakers' voting behavior. The paper assumes that there is a correlation between newspapers' portrayals of SMW and political parties' voting actions concerning the case. I borrow the concept made by the following scholars to approach

⁶ Jordan, D. L. (1993). Newspaper effects on policy preferences. *The Public Opinion Quarterly*, 51(2), 191-204; Kennedy, J. F., and Trethewy, C., and Anderson, K. (2006). Content analysis of Australian newspaper portrayals of emergency medicine. *Emergency Medicine Australasia*, 18, 118-124.

⁷ Wong, M. Y. H. (2014). The politics of the minimum wage in Hong Kong. *Journal of Contemporary Asia*, 44(4), 735-752.

this section. Cohen's study on the relationship between newspaper reports and readers' positions in the case has further explained the interaction between the two variables. Cohen explained that that media – such as newspapers – “may not be successful much of the time in telling people what to think, but it is stunningly successful in telling its readers what to think about and how to respond to the case” (pp.13)⁸. By studying the media – such as the newspapers – effect on the voting process, Cohen firstly pointed out that issue attentiveness was a critical precursor that affected the development of the policy formulation, and media was a critical factor that affected the readers' attentiveness on the issue. Cohen explained that the first step of policy change/reform was that whether people could recognize the problem or the needs to change. And media was one of the powerful agencies that could affect reader's attentiveness (to recognize the need of change) on the case. This was because media was one of the important channels that we used to gather information. Cohen further explained that why reports made by newspapers could affect our behavior. According to Cohen, information, made by particular connotation, presented by the media would lead readers to explore to certain areas of the case. This information could also lead readers to think about that how to recognize the problem/issue, and how to select particular methods/solutions to address the problem. This was because, since the storytellers had already inserted the certain connotation of the case into the reports. While readers read the reports, they might absorb particular value. Hence, storytellers' thought might affect readers' actions, such as what to think about and how to select particular methods to address the problem.

Besides, in the third section, I also study why political parties change its positions in the legislation of SMW in different time. Nelson's work is borrowed to approach this area. Nelson studied the relationship between newspapers and the lawmakers' voting actions to anti-child abuse law in the United States in 1984. According to her studies, two major factors would affect politicians' voting behavior⁹. The first factor was called as intrinsic properties and the second factor was called as political and emulative effects. She explained that the first factor could be understood as what “benefits” would be obtained from voting in favor with the motions, and the second factor could be understood as what “cost” should be paid for vetoing the motions. According to her studies, each political party had its own consideration for benefit or cost. Hence, each political party changed its positions in the case in different time because each party was affected by different factors. I borrow her concept to study why some political parties changed its positions in the legislation of

⁸ Cohen, B. C. (1963). *The press and foreign policy*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

⁹ Nelson, B. J. (1984). *Making an issue of child abuse*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

SMW in the early 2000s, and why the rest changed its positions in the late 2000s.

Background of the voting records of SMW

In this section, the general background of the lawmakers voting records of SMW is introduced. While reviewing the history of the voting, I further explain the following three questions: why I am interested in studying legislators, but not the government; why I make an attempt that mainly focuses on the voting behavior of legislators, but not the entire process of policy-making processes of SMW; Why I focus on newspaper reports, instead of other factors, while studying the voting actions of lawmakers. Before the elaboration of the general background of SMW's voting records, it is necessary to discuss the general background of the composition of LegCo members.

The Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Bureau states that two groups – geographical constituencies and functional constituencies – form the LegCo. They are given the rights to pass, to veto and to revise the government or lawmaker's bills according to the Basic Law of Hong Kong¹⁰. In general, the passage of motions, bills or amendments to government bills introduced by the government shall require at least a simple majority vote of the members of the LegCo present¹¹. If the motions, bills or amendments are introduced by individual members of the LegCo, the passage of the motions, bills or amendments shall require a simple majority vote of each of the two groups – geographical and functional constituencies – of members present. In short, they are the gate-keepers of policy formulation or adoption. However, the two groups are not generated by the same electors. Functional constituencies are mainly elected by the business sector. On the contrary, geographical constituencies are elected by all electors in the city.

It is also common to categorize lawmakers in terms of political preference. There are three types of lawmakers in LegCo under the categorization of general political preference: pro-establishment camp, pro-democracy camp and pro-business camp¹².

Overall, lawmakers in LegCo do not share a common interest. Thus, it is difficult to achieve a consensus on certain motions.

The following sections discuss how lawmakers in Hong Kong achieved a

¹⁰ The Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Bureau. (2014). The formulation of Legislative Council. Retrieved 25 March, 2014 from <http://www.cmab.gov.hk/en/issues/electoral2.htm>

¹¹ The Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Bureau. (2008). The Basic Law of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China. Hong Kong: The Printing Division, Government Logistics Department

¹² Ma, N. (2007). Political development in Hong Kong. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press; Scott, I. (2010). The public sector in Hong Kong. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.

consensus on SMW, and hence how the motion on SMW was passed by those lawmakers. The following sections first outline the general background of SMW's voting records. They also embrace a general description of political contexts in post-colonial Hong Kong.

The Asian Financial Crisis of 1997 jeopardized the economic situation in Hong Kong. Particularly, the crisis created a serious negative effect on employees. For instance, the underemployment rate shows a negative response to the economic crisis. It increased from around 1% in 1997 to almost 2.8% in 1998, only halting its increase at 3.5% in 2003¹³. Owing to the excessive demand for jobs, employers began to squeeze employees' salaries. Consequently, for the sake of their own interests in getting a job, employees were forced to accept the low-paid or underpaid jobs¹⁴. Predictably, under these circumstances, the numbers of low-income households increased dramatically. In fact, the statistics show that they increased from 11,000 households in 1996 to 15,000 in 1998 and, in 2003, over 19,000 low-income households were recorded¹⁵.

Responding to the working poor, Lee Check-yan – one of the pro-labor councilors on the Legislative Council – raised a motion on Labour Day April 1999 in LegCo. The motion aimed to persuade councilors of the benefits of SMW legislation. However, only 9 out of 50 councilors supported Lee's motion and the majority disagreed with him (See Appendix A for details). Thus, the motion was thwarted. In the following year, the socioeconomic situation got worse rather than better. The underemployment rate, and the numbers of low-income families all increased. Lee, again, introduced a motion on minimum wage in LegCo in May. Similarly, the motion only received 9 supporting votes (see Appendix B for details). The motion failed to create a consensus among the councilors - who did not think the working poor were a social problem and did not think the topic was deserving of governmental attention¹⁶.

The turning point/rising demand for the legislation came on February 2001, when the newspaper in Hong Kong widely reported a case of Outsourcing Lavatory

¹³ Social Indicators of Hong Kong (2013): The underemployment rate. Retrieved 10 October, 2013 from http://www.socialindicators.org.hk/chi/indicators/employment_and_income_security/9.6

¹⁴ From the personal interview with IP, wai-ming (on 11 September, 2013), the previous lawmaker representing labor in the Legislative Council, who used the economic theory – supply and demand – to illustrate the relationship between employers and employees in Hong Kong after the 1997 Asian Financial Crisis.

¹⁵ The Hong Kong Council of Social service (2012): The social indicator of low income households. Retrieved 10 October, 2013 from http://www.hkcss.org.hk/download/folder/fc/fc_chi.htm.

¹⁶ Yew, C. P. (2013). The road to a statutory minimum wage: Lessons and implications. In Y. N. Zheng (Ed.), *Hong Kong under Chinese rule* (pp.151-164). Singapore: Economic integration and political world scientific publishing company.

Cleaner¹⁷. These reports simultaneously exposed the sad life of low-paid laborer and they also clearly exposed how the outsourcing-contractors exploited low-skilled workers.¹⁸ The newspapers' disclosures drew the attention of the Hong Kong public to the plight of the working poor. They began to pay attention to low-paid jobs in Hong Kong, to discuss potential methods that might tackle the situation, and to talk about the responsibilities of the government¹⁹.

In April 2002, Lee Check-yan, responding to the new political situation, carried a motion in LegCo on the problem of working poverty. The motion aimed to create a better protection for laborers against the problems of the working poor and the under-paid. Despite the motion failing to attract a consensus amongst lawmakers for the legislation of a minimum wage, the voting record shows clearly the rising demand from lawmakers for the legislation of a minimum wage (See Appendix C for details). The record shows that there were 19 votes – almost twice the recorded votes in 2000 – agreeing with the motion. Those lawmakers believed that without legislation, it was not possible to remedy the problem of the working poor and the under-paid.

Yet, with the belief in marketization, government and lawmakers with business background were suspicious of the introduction of a SMW. They wondered whether a SMW might jeopardize economic development, instead of advancing economic growth²⁰. Thus, they chose to adopt alternative administrative means aimed at helping the unskilled laborer, rather than relying on legislation. The additional alternative means, for example, included reforming the terms and conditions of outsourcing contracts, and enlarging the opportunities for unskilled and inexperienced workers to pursue additional educational courses.²¹

¹⁷ A method to control outsourcing contractors. (2001, February 22). *Ming Pao Daily News*, p. A09; Government became an unscrupulous employer: A tiny income and long working hours. (2001, February 20). *Apple Daily*, p. A13.

¹⁸ After the handover, the government outsourced different types of public services to the private sector. Contractors for the government took on part of governmental responsibilities to delivery public services. However, in order to maximize their profits, these contractors squeezed the salaries of low-skilled laborers. Because this group of workers lacked bargaining power, they were willing to take the low-paid jobs.

¹⁹ The case of outsourcing lavatory cleaner was the critical factor facilitating the legislation of minimum wage. (2010, July 14). *The Sun*. Retrieved 18 October, 2013 from http://the-sun.on.cc/cnt/news/20100714/00407_008.html

²⁰ Pan, W. H., et al. (2012). *Tuan jie bu zhe wan: Xianggang du li gong yun xun suo 40 nian* (Be united as one: The exploration of labour movement in Hong Kong in recent 40-year). Hong Kong: Step Forward Multi Media Co Ltd.

²¹ The educational opportunities included job-oriented training courses and semi-professional degrees, such as Associate Degrees and High Diplomas. Students would be equipped with semi-professional knowledge after the completion of courses and degrees. Also, government would provide funding for students that had financial difficulties while they were pursuing their studies. It can be traced back to the LegCo debates on SMW policy issues: Manpower, "Proposal for a Minimum Wage in Hong Kong", available at the Hong Kong LegCo website www.Legco.gov.hk/english/index.htm

However, the second turning point of the legislation of SMW came in the late 2000s while the political situations in the city changed. For example, in 2005, one survey found that, for example, 59% of interviewees and nearly 60% of entrepreneurs in Hong Kong agreed with legislation for a SMW²². The survey also pointed out that in 2010, over 70% of interviewees agreed with the legislation for a SMW. Why the political culture changed, which created a favorable condition for the legislation of SMW? Newspaper reports was one of the factors that could explain the change. Both society's - and LegCo members' - attention to issues surrounding the legislation further increased as the number of reports on the deprivation of employees increased. For example, in March 2006, a female cleaner, who had to work 19 hours per day in order to sustain her family, suddenly died at her work place; it was revealed in August 2006 that KMB, a public transportation enterprise in Hong Kong, paid cleaners as little as HK\$8.30 an hour²³. The publication of individual cases of the working poor in Hong Kong like these examples gradually changed the entire general public's attitudes towards SMW legislation. Positions shifted towards the positive²⁴.

In response to the public demand for the legislation of a minimum wage, Donald Tsang, the Chief Executive, had to broker a compromise over the minimum wage issue and incorporate it into his political platform in 2005. Finally, the issue of the SMW was on the government agenda.

The government bill on the minimum wage was first introduced on 26 June 2009 in the LegCo, and the third reading of the bill was passed by lawmakers on 17 July 2010 (See Appendix D for details). Finally, SMW took effect from 1 May 2011.

The above discussion shows that the legislation of SMW can be made because lawmakers achieve a consensus on it. In other words, the willingness of the major lawmakers, instead of the government, affects the result of the legislation. With the purpose to get a better understanding why and how the bill on SMW is finally made, it is reasonable to focus on lawmakers.

However, why do I mainly focus on studying the voting behavior of lawmakers, but do not focus on the entire process of the policy-making processes of SMW. The above discussion shows that lawmakers' voting behavior can directly affect the development of SMW. From 1999 to 2010, lawmakers' voting actions control the development of SMW legislation. Hence, it is reasonable to study that why lawmakers

(Retrieved 10 October, 2013).

²² Oxfam Hong Kong. (2013). The history of minimum wage legislation. Retrieved 10 October, 2013 from <http://www.oxfam.org.hk/tc/ohkminiwage.aspx>

²³ Minimum Wage Organization. (2013). Statutory minimum wage ought to be introduced in Hong Kong. Retrieved 10 October, 2013 from <http://www.minwage.org.hk/logbook>

²⁴ Chen, X. Z., Hui, T., and Ye, P. Y. (2010). *Bu ren ming de gu shi: Gong meng 20 nian (Do not believe in fate: Hong Kong Confederation of Trade Unions 20 Year)*. Hong Kong: Joyful Books Company Limited.

changed their voting actions in a particular time.

Last but not least, this section points out that newspaper reports has a critical role in the policy formulation of SMW. Particularly, newspaper reports would affect lawmakers' positions in the voting process. In order to get a better understanding about how and why political parties chose particular positions while voting, I made an attempt to study newspaper reports.

The Selection of political party

Democratic Party (DP) and Liberal Party (LP) were selected to represent the political parties in the data-pool. The reasons for the selection were as follows.

First, the above two political parties were the two largest political parties in terms of the political affiliations²⁵. DP stressed the value of democracy, and LP represented the interests of business. This selection also avoided duplication of views.

Secondly, local newspapers were searched with a view to identify the groups that had been actively involved in the policy-making processes of the SMW. The above two groups were identified. For instant, these parties had participated in all discussion about the motions on SMW and illustrated their points of views on whether the government should introduce a SMW during each motion's discussion about SMW.

Thirdly, and most importantly, these two political parties did change their positions regarding motions concerning the SMW during the post-colonial years. Thus, it was important to include these parties into the database while making an attempt to study what factors eventually made these political parties show a positive attitude towards a SMW.

The selection of newspapers

In general, the local newspapers have been categorized into three types by local scholars²⁶. According to their studies, the first type of newspaper in Hong Kong is the populist newspaper. This category includes Apple Daily, Oriental Daily News, and The Sun. Those newspapers are interested in reporting the issues that are related to the interests of the general public. The second type of newspaper is the centrist newspaper, which includes Ming Pao Daily News, and South China Morning Post. Those

²⁵ Ma, N. (2007). Political development in Hong Kong. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press; Ma, N. (2012). Political parties and elections. In W. M. Lam, P. L. T. Lui and W. Wong (Eds.), *Contemporary Hong Kong government and politics* (pp.159-177). Hong Kong. Hong Kong University Press.

²⁶ Lee, L. F., and Chan, J. M. (2009). Strategic responses to political changes: An analysis of newspaper editorials in Hong Kong, 1998-2006. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Institute of Asia-Pacific Studies.

newspapers make an attempt to balance different points of view related to the reports. The last category is the economic newspaper. This category includes Hong Kong Economic Journal, and Hong Kong Economic Times. These newspapers mainly interest in reporting economic related issues and stress the value of business while reporting.

I selected Apple Daily (AD), Hong Kong Economic Journal (HKEJ) and Ming Pao Daily News (MP) to approach the empirical analysis of newspaper portrayals of SMW. The reasons for this selection were as follows.

Firstly, while approaching the selection of newspapers, I had conducted preliminary work. From the preliminary work, I identified these three newspapers were suitable for approaching this paper. I read the records of the discussion about bills on SMW from 1999 to 2010, which I identified certain newspaper reports could influence the political parties' positions while voting. For examples, the news reports on outsourced cleaner in 2001 affected DP's positions in voting, and the news reports on immoral political party of LP in 2010 affected LP's positions. I searched the above cases by reading the major local newspapers, which I found that the major papers had reported those cases in a very close time that the newspapers made the reports on the case. For instances, Apple Daily²⁷, Hong Kong Economic Times²⁸, Ming Pao Daily News²⁹, and The Sun³⁰ reported the case of outsourced cleaner in 20 February 2001, 22 February 2001, 26 February 2001, and 26 February 2001 respectively. Meanwhile, those newspapers also reported the case of immoral political party of LP in a very close time. For instances, Apple Daily³¹, Hong Kong Economic Times³², Oriental Daily News³³, Ming Pao Daily News³⁴, and Hong Kong Economic Journal³⁵ reported the case on 19 March 2010, 19 March 2010, 19 March 2010, 22 March 2010, 23 March 2010 respectively. From the above preliminary work, I could identify that the

²⁷ Government became an unscrupulous employer: A tiny income and long working hours. (2001, February 20). *Apple Daily*, p. A13.

²⁸ The Legislative Council urged the government to legislate minimum wage. (2001, February 22). *Hong Kong Economic Times*, p. A29.

²⁹ The nature of forum had been changed by the participants. (2001, February 26). *Ming Pao Daily News*, p. A08.

³⁰ Fung, F, K, K. (2001, February 26). The situation of deprivation of labor was serious in Hong Kong and government was disappointed by the employers' actions to employees. *The Sun*, p. D08.

³¹ Tommy Cheung was labelled as an immoral lawmaker. (2010, March 19). *Apple Daily*, p. A10.

³² Yip, K, Y. (2010, March 19). The wage level of minimum wage was a controversial issue between business and labor representatives.. *Hong Kong Economic Times*, p. A28.

³³ Labor representatives were disappointed by the business suggestions. (2010, March 19). *Oriental Daily News*, p. A04.

³⁴ A Single parent said the business's suggestion about minimum wage could not sustain her living in the city. (2010, March 22). *Ming Pao Daily News*, p. A04.

³⁵ Liberal Party did not agree with Tommy Cheung's comment on minimum wage. (2010, March 23). *Hong Kong Economic Journal*, p. P10.

selected three newspapers included the articles that I needed while approaching the paper.

Secondly, by selecting the above three newspapers, a more comprehensive conclusion could be drawn. The connotations and themes of articles presented by the selected newspapers were not similar. AD, being populist-oriented, paid attention to the interests of the general public. HKEJ, being business-oriented, stressed the interests of the market. MP, being centrist-oriented, emphasized that their news reports were neutral. The selection of newspapers helped avoid unnecessary duplication - giving a more comprehensive set of empirical data.

Coding

The coding sheet created by the University of Hong Kong and the assumptions of the paper are employed to design categories to code the selected newspaper articles. Before the discussion of the coding procedures of coding, a wider discussion of coding is perhaps necessary.

Coding is one of important stages of content analysis³⁶. Generally speaking, coding is an analytical process to systematically record, identify, and categorize raw-data obtained from sampling, which facilitates the work of analysis³⁷. Specifically, coding is the analytical process focusing on the transformation of raw-data (in this study, the data refers to the manifest content of the newspaper articles) into conceptual categories³⁸. After the completion of coding, the raw-data is sorted into different categories, which facilitates systematic interpretation and reporting of the research findings. Besides, coding was an important step that would help me to get a better understanding about the interaction between newspaper's reports and lawmakers' voting behavior. While I was approaching coding by means of studying reports' content, I would identify how and when lawmakers made responses to particular issues related to SMW and to their voting behavior. Particularly, I might get the information that how lawmakers got the information about working, the idea of SMW, and the need to legislate SMW.

This study referred to the University of Hong Kong (HKU) scheme and the assumptions of the paper when constructing a coding sheet to organize the

³⁶ Levintova, E. (2010). Good neighbours?: Dominant narratives about the "other" in contemporary Polish and Russian newspapers. *Europe-Asia Studies*, 62(8), 1339-1361.

³⁷ Babbie, E. R. (2013). *The practice of social research*. Belmont, California: Wadsworth Cengage Learning.

³⁸ Berelson, B. (1952). *Content analysis in communication research*. New York: Hafner Press.

interviewees' perceptions of the SMW.³⁹ Four major themes – positive, negative, neutral and others – were used to categorize the data, and the general description of each category follows (Appendix E shows the coding sheet for this paper).

In the positive portrayal category, the portrayals of the article in question showed favorable attitudes towards SMW legislation. This category included the sub-categories the article viewed a SMW as creating a safety network for low-skilled laborers, that it would facilitate economic development, and that it would benefit all workers in society.

Negative portrayals included descriptions that conveyed feelings of hostility towards a SMW. The sub-categories included were that a SMW would affect economic development, that it would lead to an increase in the unemployment rate and that it would affect the self-adjustment mechanism of the market.

Neutral portrayals were defined as including both positive and negative arguments. The two sides of the argument should be given similar weight in the articles. Neutral articles focused on the description of the statistics relating to a SMW, rather than discussing the implications of the statistics. Neutral articles were also defined by their focus on the operational terms of a SMW.

Besides the above three categories, an additional category named 'others' was devised. The others category included those articles where the main gist of the article was not related to the legislation for a SMW in Hong Kong. For example, articles discussing a SMW in foreign countries, articles discussing a SMW in the context of foreign domestic workers, or articles focusing on the discussion of other issues.

Data analysis

The data gathered from the study is used to find patterns (themes of newspaper portrayals), commonalities (the patterns of distribution of portrayals across the time), and the relationship between newspaper portrayals and the voting behavior of LegCo members. The explanation takes reference from a correlation approach.

A correlation referred a relationship between two or more thing⁴⁰. Specifically, a

³⁹ HKU studied public opinion towards a SMW between 2005 and 2010. Two categories – positive and negative – had been designed to code interviewees' opinions. In general, if the interviewees thought SMW would create positive effect – such as helping the working poor or facilitating economic growth – their evidence was coded into the positive category. If the interviewees thought a SMW would create negative effects – such as leading to an increase in the unemployment rate or affecting market operation – their evidence was coded into the negative category. Detailed information of the research design is available on the HKU website. See http://hkupop.hku.hk/english/report/oxfam_mw2010/ (Retrieved 20 August, 2013)

⁴⁰ Cocca, C. E. (2002). The politics of statutory rape laws: Adoption and reinvention of morality policy in the states, 1971-1999. *Palgrave Macmillan Journals*, V35 (1), 51-72.

correlation was a relationship between two or more things which changed that could be described or observed⁴¹. For example, according to a study conducted by Grossmont College (2014), someone might claim that when he or she awakes at 10:00 AM, the sun is up⁴². He or she would collect relevant information about these events over a period of time. Hence, he or she would expect to find a correlation that while he or she awakes at 10:00 AM, the sun will be up. Or, He or she would gather information to support the correlation in the negative: when he or she awakes at 04:00 AM, the sun is not up. General speaking, a correlation refers that there is an interaction between the two factors.

However, a correlation does not refer to causation. For example, awaking at 10:00 AM did not cause the rising sun. A cause was something that resulted in an effect. For example, according to the college's study, heating water to a certain temperature made it boil. It was to say that A (heating water to a certain temperature) was the sufficient condition for B (the water boil) if there was a causation between A and B. If there was a correlation between A and B, it was to say that A was a necessary condition for B. For example, considered the case of violent video games (A) might influence aggression (B)⁴³. This case study explained that video game was one of the factors responsible for violent behavior. Other factors – such as poorer socioeconomic status, mental illness and bad parenting – might also responsible for aggression. Hence, research would only say that there was a correlation between A and B, rather than concluded that A determined B. However, the above case study explained that correlation study was valuable. Using the research approach of correlation would facilitate the researchers to study and to evaluate the relationship between each variable. Particularly, while researches began to study a new area or made an attempt to identify the interaction among each variable, correlation study would help the researcher to approach these studies. After getting a better understanding about the interaction between variables, researchers would be able to draw a better conclusion that what was the relationship between A and B, and how A might influence B. After the completion of correlation study, research would begin to investigate whether there was causation between A and B. In other words, correlation study would help the researchers to identify the interaction among each variable and

⁴¹ Australian Bureau of Statistics. (2014). The concept of correlation. Retrieved 8 November, 2014 from <http://www.abs.gov.au/websitedbs/a3121120.nsf/home/statistical+language+-+correlation+and+causation>

⁴² Grossmont College. (2014). The concept of correlation. Retrieved 8 November, 2014 From <http://www.grossmont.edu/johnnoakes/s110online/Causation%20versus%20Crelation.pdf>

⁴³ Anderson, C. A., and Dill, K. E. (2000). Video games and aggressive thoughts, feelings, and behavior in the laboratory and in life. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 78 (4), 772–790.

to decide the further steps of research.

In this study, two variables are examined. They are “the selected political parties’ voting actions with regard to the SMW” and “the portrayals of the SMW by the selected newspapers”. An attempt is made to identify whether there is a correlation between the above two variables by studying the impact of the change in the pattern of newspaper portrayals of the SMW on the voting behavior of lawmakers, and the interaction between the above two variables.

Newspaper portrays of SMW in the post-colonial era

This section shows portrayals of SMW in terms of themes. Of the 2,764 SMW legislation portrayals ratings, 513(18.56%) were positive, 347 (12.55%) were negative, 447 (16.17 %) were neutral and 1,457 (52.71%) were others.⁴⁴ The overall picture of SMW portrayals is represented in Appendix F. While the data of neutral and other portrayals is excluded, 860 articles that met the requirements of this study from the selected newspapers are identified. Of the 860 articles, 513 (59.65%) were positive and 347 (40.35%) were negative. The overall SMW portrayals are presented in Appendix G.

Changes in the pattern of portrayals of SMW from 1998 to 2010

The analysis indicates that a total of 12 themes were reported (See Appendix E for details). They included 3 positive themes, 3 negative themes, 3 neutral themes and 3 others themes. The most common theme used to portray the SMW from 1998 to 2010 was “Focusing on the discussion of other issues” (O2) (Appendix E shows the glossary - see Appendix H and Appendix I for details).

The second most common theme used to frame the news about the SMW was diverse - because it changed across the time. Between 1998 and 2010, the second most common theme was “Including a same distribution of positive and negative arguments about SMW” (NEU1) - with four exceptions in 2000, 2002, 2003 and 2009. In 2000, the theme of “Creating a safety net for low-skilled laborers” (P1) was evaluated as the second most common theme and; in 2002 and 2003, the theme of “Discussing a SMW in the context of foreign domestic workers in Hong Kong” (O1) was evaluated as the second most common theme; in 2009, the theme of “Benefiting all workers in society” (P3) was evaluated as the second most common theme.

The third most common theme used when making news about a SMW changed a lot between 1998 and 2010. In 1998, the theme of “Affecting the self-adjustment

⁴⁴ All calculations are to two decimal places.

mechanism of the market” (N3) was evaluated as the third most common theme. Later, the theme of “Leading to an increase in the unemployment rate” (N2) was evaluated as the third most common theme in 1999. In 2000, NEU1 was ranked as the third most common theme. P1 took the position of NEU1 and it became the third most common theme used to portray the SMW in 2001. However, in 2002 and 2003, NEU1 was evaluated as the third most common theme again. Later, P1 was evaluated as the third most common theme between 2004 and 2010 with two exceptions in 2009 and 2010. In 2009, O1 took the position of P1 and it was assessed as the third most common theme. In 2010, P3 was evaluated as the third most common theme.

Overall, the above discussion shows that the themes of O2 and NEU1 were the major themes used by the selected newspapers to make the news about the SMW from 1998 to 2010. The third most common theme used to frame the SMW changed a lot during the period.

The dominating role of O2 and NEU1 in the newspapers’ selection of themes had two major implications. Firstly, that by showing favor to the two themes, the newspapers had an intention to provide information and different perspectives about the SMW to readers (for example, NEU1 focused on the discussion about different perspectives and arguments regarding the legislation of SMW; besides, the theme of O2 referred that the issue of SMW had been inserted into other issues and hence, while readers were reading the newspapers, they were reading the relationship between the issue of SMW and other social issues). Secondly, that the readers’ understanding of the issues surrounding the legislation of a SMW in Hong Kong was increasing. Since the newspaper articles were most interested in discussions about different perspectives and additional information about the legislation of SMW, by reading the reports, understanding about the case could increase amongst readers.

The previous studies on newspapers might explain why the papers tended to use the themes of others and neutral to make news. It stated that the local newspapers could be classified in terms of readership, such as populist-oriented newspapers and centrist-oriented newspapers⁴⁵. In other words, there was no a single newspaper that was primarily interested in reporting labor issues. Hence, the selected newspapers might not show a clear or strong preference while making the news of SMW.

⁴⁵ Lee, L. F., and Chan, J. M. (2009). Strategic responses to political changes: An analysis of newspaper editorials in Hong Kong, 1998-2006. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Institute of Asia-Pacific Studies.

Relationship between newspaper portrayals and lawmakers' voting actions

The case study of DP

Between 1998 and 2002, I identified three articles that had an interaction with DP's voting behavior. These articles were belonging to the theme of "Creating a safety net for low-skilled laborers" (P1). The connotation of this theme referred that articles make an attempt to explain that the legislation would create a safety net for low-paid workers. This is because after the legislation, employers are required to provide a reasonable salary for low-skilled laborers to sustain their living. In other words, the legislation is an effective method against under-paid and deprivation of low-skilled laborers. Three identified articles were included in this theme and shared the same connotation with this theme.

These articles were firstly published on 20 February 2001 by Apple Daily (AD)⁴⁶, were secondly published on 26 February 2001 by Ming Pao Daily News (MP)⁴⁷, and were thirdly published on 27 April 2001 by AD⁴⁸. The above articles all discussed a same issue that an outsourced cleaner received HK\$7 per hours and he was required to work over 12 hours per day, and these articles did not appear on the newspapers before 20 February 2000. These articles attributed the above situation of working poor to the deprivation of low-skilled workers. Particularly, these articles argued that low-skilled laborers lacked bargaining power to negotiate better salaries. Since there was no wage-protection for laborers, employers tended to maximize their income by squeezing the salaries paid to low-skilled laborers. As a result, the low skilled laborers had to receive a low salary. These articles also suggested lawmakers in Hong Kong should agree with the legislation of a SMW before it was too late to deal with working poverty. This was because both government officials and lawmakers in Hong Kong did not believe the market delivered disorder; they also ignored the public demand for reforming the protection given to low-skilled laborers. As a result of this situation, low-skilled laborers could not obtain a reasonable salary. In order to tackle the problem, these articles suggested the government to legislate SMW.

There was an obvious interaction between the above newspaper reports and DP's voting behavior. For instance, newspapers reports on Outsourcing Lavatory Cleaner had attracted the attention of DP. When the case was reported by AD on 20 February

⁴⁶ Government became an unscrupulous employer: A tiny income and long working hours. (2001, February 20). *Apple Daily*, p. A13.

⁴⁷ The nature of forum had been changed by the participants. (2001, February 26). *Ming Pao Daily News*, p. A08.

⁴⁸ United nation's committees of human right were dissatisfied with Lam Woon-kwong's article. (2001, April 27). *Apple Daily*, p. A18.

2001, DP made a quick response during the LegCo meeting of 21 February 2001⁴⁹. DP stated that the newspapers' reports on Outsourcing Lavatory Cleaner not only made DP take notice of the problem of the deprivation of low-skilled laborers, but also addressed one of the party's major questions of whether the market was capable of providing for fair salaries to low-skilled laborers. According to DP, a wage of HK\$7 per hour was not acceptable - since such a tiny salary would not sustain an employee living in the city. The party explained that, under normal market arrangements, the combination of long working hours and tiny salaries could not exist. This was because, according to DP, a normal market would provide a reasonable salary and working schedule to low-skilled laborers. However, what DP took from the case of Outsourcing Lavatory Cleaner was that the market had failed to perform properly and that the deprivation of low-skilled laborers in the city was serious. In fact, the trigger event of outsourced cleaner was related to Nelson's point that a new environment would affect lawmakers' problem identification and policy formulation. Particularly, it might influence lawmakers' voting actions. This was because, from the news reports, the party not only took notice of the potential benefit of the legislation of the law, but it also took notice of the needs of the legislation.

Indeed, DP stated that the newspapers' reports pointed out that without the legislation of a SMW, the deprivation of employees could not be remedied. This was because the existing market arrangements gave the right to employers to maximize their benefits by squeezing the low-skilled laborers' salaries. The best method to remedy the deprivation of low-skilled laborers was to introduce a SMW. This was because, after the legislation, employers would be required to give a reasonable salary to low-skilled laborers. Thus, he concluded that DP would vote in favor with the motion. From DP's argument, we saw that how the trigger event made by the newspaper could affect Democratic Party's position while voting.

Later, on April 2002, on the discussion about motion on the problem of working poverty, Albert Chan one of the DP lawmakers stated the similar points mentioned by the party in 2001⁵⁰.

From the above discussion, the correlation between the newspaper's reports on

⁴⁹ The motion was firstly moved to the LegCo by Lee Cheuk-yan, and its initial purpose was to discuss the legislation of SMW. The motion was then modified by Yeung Yiu-chung and the motion's purpose was similar with Lee's motion. Details information was available at Hong Kong, Legislative Council, *Official record of proceedings*, (21 February 2001a) at 4124 (Lee Cheuk-yan), online: Debates of the Legislative Council (Hansard <<http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr01-02/chinese/counmtg/hansard/cm0424ti-translae-c.pdf> >

⁵⁰ The details information would be found on the Legislative Council website, see Hong Kong, Legislative Council, *Official record of proceedings*, (24 April 2002c) at 4143 (Albert Chan), online: Debates of the Legislative Council (Hansard <<http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr01-02/chinese/counmtg/hansard/cm0424ti-translate-c.pdf> >

SMW and the voting behavior of DP had identified. DP's lawmakers voted in favor with the motions after the publication of the reports on outsourced cleaner. And more importantly, these lawmakers had confessed that newspapers facilitated DP to take notice of the problem of working poor, and to take notice of the need to vote in favor with the motion.

Indeed, Sin Chung-kai, one of the vice presidents of DP and a DP lawmaker, had pointed out that the important role of newspaper reports in affecting the party's selection of positions while voting during the interview.⁵¹ Sin firstly stated that the party was doubt about the legislation of SMW. According to Sin, DP believed that the market was an effective mechanism that adjusted reasonable salaries for low-skilled laborers, and therefore the party did not vote in favor of the motions on the minimum wage in 1999 and 2000. He secondly pointed that, however, in 2001, the newspaper reports on the cleaner clearly illustrated that the party's belief was not correct. This was because, from these reports, DP took notice that low-skilled laborers could not receive a reasonable salary and protection from the market since the operation of the market was disorder. And more importantly, according to Sin, these reports attracted the party attention to pay attention to the problem of working poor, and to pay attention to search the potential solutions against the problem. The trigger event of outsourced cleaner facilitated the party to use a new perspective to look at the problem and to think solutions against the problem. Indeed, Sin stated that newspaper's report was one of the important factors that shaped the party's positions in the voting process. According to Sin, newspaper's reports could serve as one of the important factors that could facilitate the party to evaluate its positions in the legislation of SMW. This was because, from the reports, the party could get better knowledge about the potential solutions against the problem, and the cost and benefit of using certain solutions to address the problem. And the information presented by the reports could help the party to measure the feasibility – such as the general public interests in the legislation of SMW – of the introduction of particular solutions. Thus, Sin concluded that if the newspapers did not report the trigger event of outsourced cleaner, the party could not obtain a new perspective to think the problem and the party might not vote in favor with the motions on SMW. Hence, he concluded that newspaper's reports on SMW were one of the important factors affecting the voting behavior the party.

The case study of LP

Despite LP taking notice of the case of Outsourcing Lavatory Cleaner in 2001

⁵¹ Sin, C. K. (2014, March 3). Personal Interview.

and the party also confessing that the situation of the cleaner was painful, LP did not agree with the legislation of a SMW (*Official record of proceedings*, 14 July 2010a). With LP coming to an understanding that the introduction of a SMW would not jeopardize economic growth, the party moved its position in the case from negative to positive in 2010⁵². This paper studied that how newspaper portrayals of the SMW might influence LP voting actions and emphasizes that the newspaper reports might stimulate the party to agree with the legislation. In the following paragraphs, I first point out that what articles might influence the positions of LP. Secondly, I discuss the interaction between newspaper's reports and LP's voting behavior.

Between 2002 and 2010, I identified four articles – published by the theme of “Facilitating the economic development” (P2) – that had an interaction with LP's voting behavior⁵³. The connotation of this theme was that articles tried to argue that the legislation would advance the economic development in the city. This was because employees would receive a better income after the legislation of SMW. Hence, they would have extra money to do the consumption. The consumption would be a source to facilitate the economic development. Meanwhile, this type of articles would pay attention to the area that since employees would have a better wage protection after the legislation, their demand for the government subsidies would decrease. The pressure of raising the tax level to cover the social expenditure would be relaxed. A relative low tax level would facilitate the business growth.

These articles were firstly published on 23 September 2008 by AD⁵⁴, were secondly published on 31 July 2009 by MP⁵⁵, were thirdly published on 22 March 2010 by AD⁵⁶, and were fourthly published on 7 May 2010 by MP⁵⁷. The above articles all discussed a same issue that the introduction of a SMW would facilitate the

⁵² Hong Kong, Legislative Council, *Official record of proceedings*, (15 July 2010a) at 7917 - 7921 (Tommy Cheung), online: Debates of the Legislative Council (Hansard < <http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/chinese/counmtg/hansard/cm0715-translate-c.pdf> >

⁵³ The newspaper reports on the SMW from 2002 to 2010 were inspected for the following reasons. Firstly, even though LP confessed that the case of outsourced cleaner in 2001 facilitated the party to take notice of the situation of working poor, LP did not agree the legislation of SMW. In other words, newspaper reports published between 1998 and 2001 could not affect the LP's voting actions. Secondly, I read all newspaper reports from 1998 to 2010 to identify articles that were related to why LP changed its positions in the case from negative to positive. I found that LP began to pay attention to the newspaper reports in 2008.

⁵⁴ Stanley Ho was dissatisfied with the performance of LP in the 2008 LegCo election. (2008, September 23). *Apple Daily*, p. A08.

⁵⁵ To, D. (2009, July 31). Do not create threatens and fallacies: A discussion on whether SMW should apply to foreign domestic helpers. *Ming Pao Daily News*, p. A32.

⁵⁶ The minimum wage level disaffected the society: Tommy Cheung suggested that the minimum wage level might start below HK\$20. (2010, March 22). *Apple Daily*, p. A02.

⁵⁷ Leung, C. Y. (2010, May 7). Statutory minimum wage: A review of employers' statistics. *Ming Pao Daily News*, p. A14.

economic development in Hong Kong. At the same time, these articles were firstly introduced to the newspapers on 23 September 2008, and these articles were different from the articles that affected the voting behavior of DP. For instance, the theme of these articles stated that a negative relationship between the legislation of a SMW and the economic development might not be found in Hong Kong. On the contrary, a positive relationship between the above two factors might be found in the city. This was because after the introduction of a SMW, workers would receive a better salary. Because of the increase in the salary, workers might purchase services from the consumption market. This activity might facilitate the economic growth.

There was an obvious interaction between the above newspaper reports and LP's voting behavior. I firstly briefly pointed out the key points of the reports and, secondly discuss the interaction between the above two factors. On 23 September 2008, a news article published by AD pointed out that business sector did not agree with the negative position of LP⁵⁸. According to the article, the business sector representatives attributed the 2008 LegCo election failure of LP to their position on the SMW.⁵⁹ LP had not balanced societal demand for a SMW with business interests and, hence, LP had not gained public support in the election and LP decision might affect the development of the city. Besides this, the article also pointed out that the business sector agreed with the legislation of a SMW because the sector thought a SMW was able to balance economic development with the welfare development of laborers.

In addition, an article for MP, published on 31 July 2009, argued that, if a SMW applied to Hong Kong, both employees (including permanent Hong Kong citizens and foreign domestic workers) and economic development would benefit⁶⁰. The article explained that, after the legislation, employees would receive a better income to sustain their family livings. At the same time, higher salaries would increase the productivity of the employees. Higher productivity would ultimately facilitate economic development.

Moreover, in early March 2010, Tommy Cheung, a lawmaker and one of the vice-presidents of LP, stated that the minimum wage level should start at HK\$20. The local newspapers broadly reported Cheung's suggestion. They used negative themes – such as unscrupulous employers and unscrupulous political parties – to report the case. The reports successfully attracted the attention of society and LP were subsequently

⁵⁸ Stanley Ho was dissatisfied with the performance of LP in the 2008 LegCo election. (2008, September 23). *Apple Daily*, p. A08.

⁵⁹ The representatives came from the Real Estate Developers Association of Hong Kong and the Chinese Manufacturers' Association of Hong Kong. More importantly, this was the very first time the business sector changed its perception of a SMW from negative to positive.

⁶⁰ To, D. (2009, July 31). Do not create threatens and fallacies: A discussion on whether SMW should apply to foreign domestic helpers. *Ming Pao Daily News*, p. A32.

labeled as unscrupulous employers - while local newspapers frequently reported that LP was an unscrupulous political party⁶¹. Indeed, an article published by MP on 22 March 2010 pointed out that the business sector was dissatisfied with LP's position on the SMW⁶². The report also mentioned that the business sector was willing to negotiate with laborers and society in order to facilitate the legislation of a SMW and the economic development in Hong Kong.

Additionally, a report published by MP on May 7, which argued that a reasonable minimum-wage level not only benefited low-skilled laborers, but also facilitated economic growth⁶³. The article pointed out that the arguments made by employers were not persuasive. This was because, according to the article, it was not possible for employers to predict the exact unemployment rate before the introduction of a SMW, and it was also not possible for employers to draw a solid relationship between a SMW and the rising unemployment rate before the introduction of a SMW. On the contrary, the article argued that if members in Hong Kong were willing to negotiate the details of a SMW rationally and pragmatically, SMW would benefit both laborers and economic development.

How did LP respond to the newspaper reports? There was an obvious interaction between LP and the newspaper reports on the SMW. For instance, on a report published by AD on 12 October 2008, LP stated that the party took notice that not only the general public, but also the business sector was dissatisfied with LP's performance of the 2008 LgeCo election. The party would soon review its orientation, and confessed that the party would pay more attention to other members' interests when making decisions about how to vote on the SMW⁶⁴. In fact, LP took notice of the potential cost that was needed to pay for if the party did not change its positions in the legislation from the newspaper reports. Also, LP took notice of the potential benefits – such as the electors' needs and the political culture – of the legislation from the reports. Thus, LP's positions could be influenced.

Furthermore, on 7 August 2009, Michael Tien, a member of LP, made a response to the article published by MP on 31 July 2009⁶⁵. He stated that LP had learnt from

⁶¹ The minimum wage level disaffected the society: Tommy Cheung suggested that the minimum wage level might start below HK\$20. (2010, March 22). *Apple Daily*, p. A02.

⁶² Jeffery Lam explained that the business sector was dissatisfied with Liberal Party's opinion on SMW. (2010, March 22). *Ming Pao Daily News*, p. A29.

⁶³ Leung, C. Y. (2010, May 7). Statutory minimum wage: A review of employers' statistics. *Ming Pao Daily News*, p. A14.

⁶⁴ The members of Liberal Party worried about the sponsorship from the Real Estate Developers Association of Hong Kong and, LP responded that the sponsorship for the party's operation was stable. (2008, October 12). *Apple Daily*, p. A06.

⁶⁵ Tien, M. P. S. (2009, August 7). Envisaging the potential impact of statutory minimum wage on the society – responding to the Association for the Advancement of Feminism's comment about SMW,

the perspective of the article and learnt from the points made by the article that a SMW would create benefits for both Hong Kong citizens and the economy. More importantly, Tien stated that LP was willing to listen and to exchange different perspectives about the SMW with the members in the society. He encouraged the members in the society to illustrate their perspective on the legislation in detail and promised LP would gain a better understanding of the SMW as a result. Tien's words pointed out that the party learnt the potential benefits that could be obtained from the legislation. Also, since the party took notice of the potential benefits of the legislation, the party also paid attention to the development of the case.

LP also made responses to the articles claiming LP was an immoral political party. LP explained that the party was not unscrupulous and that the party understood from newspaper reports that their view of the SMW might not be correct⁶⁶. What was more, in the article response, LP stated that the party was willing to study the case and find a method which balanced the needs of society and the party. In other words, LP realized that potential cost that the party had to pay for if the party did not vote in favor with the law. The party learnt that the political culture was in favor with the legislation. Once the party did not agree with the law, the party might be labeled as an unscrupulous political party. This labelling effect would affect the reputation of the party, which might affect the political career of the party.

Furthermore, LP also made responses to the article published by MP on 7 May 2010. Tommy Cheung, a lawmaker of LP, explained that he had learnt from the article's argument that a reasonable minimum-wage level would balance the need of the laborers and economic reality⁶⁷. He also stated that he was willing to receive more information about the article's argument and would re-consider his position on the legislation of a minimum wage.

Indeed, during the personal interview with Tommy Cheung, he further explained how newspaper's reports would affect the party's voting behavior.⁶⁸ Cheung firstly stated that newspaper reports had been one of the most important channels that helped the party to get a better understanding of the SMW in the late 2000s. He pointed out that there was no a single formal communication channel between LP and other political parties, between LP and the government, and between LP and the general public. It was not possible for LP to get a clearly image about other actors' perception on the case, and the potential cost and benefit of the legislation under the above

Ming Pao Daily News, p. A32.

⁶⁶ Liberal Party disagreed with Tommy Cheung's suggestion. (2010, March 23). *Ming Pao Daily News*, p. A04.

⁶⁷ Cheung, T. (2010, May 20). A response to Leung Chun-ying's article. *Ming Pao Daily News*, p. A32.

⁶⁸ Cheung, T. (2013, December 17). Personal interview.

condition. In order to get a better understanding about other actors' considerations and the information of the case, LP needed to rely on other channels. Newspaper was one of the channels to gather information. This was because, according to Cheung, newspaper's reports covered or included several actors' considerations and the information of the case. And hence, by reading the newspaper reports, the party might be able to obtain the latest information – such as different perspectives and arguments, and the supporting evidence – about the legislation of a SMW. This information was important. This was because the information might help the party to gain a better picture of the SMW and allowed the party to take corresponding action. Between 2008 and 2010, the party could get the knowledge about the general public and the interests of different business organizations through the newspaper reports. Also, the party could take notice of the potential cost of the legislation from the newspaper reports. Meanwhile, the party could take notice of the potential benefits of a SMW from the newspaper reports and the need to legislate SMW, which constantly argued that the introduction of a SMW might facilitate both economic and labor welfare development. For example, Cheung pointed out that reports on unscrupulous political party affected LP lawmakers' positions in the case. LP lawmaker took notice of the cost that they needed to pay for if the party did not agree with the legislation. LP lawmakers also took notice of the fact that political culture was ready for the legislation. Hence, the party re-evaluated its positions and re-considered the voting decision of the motion on the SMW in 2010. Cheung's words pointed out that newspaper's reports not only could help the party to take notice of the problem of working poor, but it could also help the party to take notice the need to vote in favor of SMW.

From the above discussion, it is reasonable to argue that there is a correlation between newspaper reports on the SMW and the voting actions of LP lawmakers. It can be seen that newspaper reports could continually influence LP thought on the subject of the SMW. It has also been shown that LP members changed their voting behavior after those newspaper articles about the SMW were published.

Conclusion

This paper makes an attempt to remedy the weaknesses of previous research. It is assumed that the newspapers in Hong Kong acted as storytellers that facilitated the lawmakers in the city - identifying the problem of working poor and the need to make the legislation of SMW. The study also pays attention to a specific question of why lawmakers changed their positions regarding SMW while they oversaw the issues

with working poor and minimum wage legislation. The paper assumes that the local newspapers' portrayals of SMW might influence the lawmakers' positions.

Firstly, the research findings show that selected newspapers preferred positive themes to negative themes when discussing SMW since 2004. Before 2004, SMW portrayals were diverse. Secondly, the research findings show that the interaction between the readers' attention to the issues and the newspapers' attention to those issues were mutual. On the one hand, while the readers' attention to the issue of SMW increased, the number of reports made by the newspapers on the subject increased - and vice versa. On the other hand, the newspapers successfully attracted and maintained their readers' attention to SMW via their reporting techniques.

Additionally, the research findings point out that the newspapers had an important role in the policy-making process of SMW. They show that policy-makers would take notice of the needs for the legislation of SMW via the newspapers' reports and hence re-evaluated their positions regarding the case.

Last but not least, the research findings show that there was a correlation between newspaper portrayals and the voting behavior of lawmakers. In general, the three major political parties in Hong Kong – Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong, Democratic Party and Liberal Party – changed their positions after the publication of newspaper articles addressing the parties' consideration for the legislation of the minimum wage.

Appendixes

Appendix A: The voting records of motion on Labour Day in 1999 and political affiliations of the selected lawmakers

投票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 28/04/1999
 時間 TIME: 10:58:54 PM
 動議 MOTION: 「勞動節」議案
 MOTION ON "LABOUR DAY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	25	
投票 Vote	25	24	
贊成 Yes	3	6	
反對 No	17	4	
棄權 Abstain	5	14	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
何承天 Edward HO	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
何敏嘉 Michael HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
何耀泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
李家祥 Eric LI	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
李啟明 LEE Kai-ming	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國寶 Dr David LI		陸恭蕙 Christine LOH	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW		程介南 CHENG Kai-nam	棄權 ABSTAIN
夏佳理 Ronald ARCULLI		黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
張永森 Ambrose CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shuk	贊成 YES
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
陳榮燦 CHAN Wing-chan	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
梁智鴻 Dr LEONG Che-hung	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN		
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	朱幼麟 David CHU	
劉卓發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	何世柱 HO Sai-chu	反對 NO
劉健儀 Mrs Miriam LAU	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		吳清輝 Prof NG Ching-fai	反對 NO
羅致光 LAW Chi-kwong		馬逢國 MA Fung-kuok	反對 NO
馮志堅 FUNG Chi-kin	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	

秘書 CLERK



Political Affiliations of the selected lawmakers in 1999

DP		
Year	Name	Voting Record
1999	Michael HO	ABSTAIN
1999	CHEUNG Man-kwong	ABSTAIN
1999	SIN Chung-kai	ABSTAIN
1999	LAW Chi-kwong	ABSENT
1999	Albert HO	ABSTAIN
1999	LEE Wing-tat	ABSTAIN
1999	Martin LEE	ABSTAIN
1999	Fred LI	ABSTAIN
1999	James TO	ABSTAIN
1999	Dr YEUNG Sum	ABSTAIN
1999	LAU Chin-shek	YES
1999	Andrew CHENG	ABSENT
1999	SZETO Wah	ABSTAIN

LP		
Year	Name	Voting Record
1999	James TIEN	NO
1999	Edward HO	NO
1999	Mrs Selina CHOW	ABSENT
1999	Ronald ARCULLI	ABSENT
1999	Howard YOUNG	NO
1999	LAU Wong-fat	NO
1999	Mrs Miriam LAU	NO
1999	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	NO
1999	HO Sai-chu	NO
1999	Kenneth TING	NO

Appendix B: The voting records of motion on Minimum Wage in 2000 and political affiliations of the selected lawmakers

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 17/05/2000
時間 TIME: 08:52:33 PM

動議 MOTION: 「最低工資」議案
MOTION ON "MINIMUM WAGE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	23	
投票 Vote	20	22	
贊成 Yes	3	6	
反對 No	16	12	
棄權 Abstain	1	4	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
何承天 Edward HO		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
何敏嘉 Michael HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
李家祥 Eric LI	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
李啟明 LEE Kai-ming	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
李國寶 Dr David LI		陸恭愷 Christine LOH	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW		程介南 CHENG Kai-nam	
夏佳理 Ronald ARCULLI		黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳榮燦 CHAN Wing-chan	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
梁智鴻 Dr LEONG Che-hung	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO		
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		朱幼麟 David CHU	反對 NO
劉健儀 Mrs Miriam LAU	反對 NO	何世柱 HO Sai-chu	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
羅致光 LAW Chi-kwong	反對 NO	吳清輝 Prof NG Ching-fai	反對 NO
馮志堅 FUNG Chi-kin		馬逢國 MA Fung-kuok	反對 NO
鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
		楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK 

Political Affiliations of the selected lawmakers in 2000

DP		
Year	Name	Voting Record
2000	Michael HO	NO
2000	CHEUNG Man-kwong	NO
2000	SIN Chung-kai	NO
2000	LAW Chi-kwong	NO
2000	Albert HO	ABSENT
2000	LEE Wing-tat	NO
2000	Martin LEE	NO
2000	Fred LI	NO
2000	James TO	ABSENT
2000	Dr YEUNG Sum	NO
2000	LAU Chin-shek	YES
2000	Andrew CHENG	ABSENT
2000	SZETO Wah	NO

LP		
Year	Name	Voting Record
2000	Kenneth TING	NO
2000	James TIEN	NO
2000	Edward HO	ABSENT
2000	Mrs Selina CHOW	ABSENT
2000	Ronald ARCULLI	ABSENT
2000	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	NO
2000	Howard YOUNG	NO
2000	LAU Wong-fat	ABSENT
2000	Mrs Miriam LAU	NO
2000	HO Sai-chu	NO

Appendix C: The voting records of motion on The Problem of Working Poverty in 2002 and political affiliations of the selected lawmakers

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 24/04/2002
 時間 TIME: 11:41:35 PM
 動議 MOTION: 「在職貧窮問題」議案
 MOTION ON "THE PROBLEM OF "WORKING POVERTY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	23	
投票 Vote	21	22	
贊成 Yes	6	13	
反對 No	13	4	
棄權 Abstain	2	5	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	
田北俊 James TIEN		何傑仁 Albert HO	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Eric LI		李柱銘 Martin LEE	
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
吳露儀 Margaret NG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳耀林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kyong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄧永榮 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 LAW Chi-kyong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮煥基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永榮 Dr LO Wing-jok	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬建國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

Political Affiliations of the selected lawmakers in 2002

DP		
Year	Name	Voting Record
2002	CHEUNG Man-kwong	YES
2002	SIN Chung-kai	YES
2002	LAU Chi-kwong	YES
2002	Albert HO	ABSENT
2002	Martin LEE	ABSENT
2002	Fred LI	YES
2002	James TO	ABSENT
2002	Dr YEUNG Sum	YES
2002	SZETO Wah	YES
2002	WONG Sing-chi	YES
2002	Andrew CHENG	YES
2002	Albert CHAN	YES

LP		
Year	Name	Voting Record
2002	Kenneth TING	NO
2002	James TIEN	ABSENT
2002	Mrs Selina CHOW	NO
2002	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	NO
2002	Howard YOUNG	NO
2002	LAU Wong-fat	NO
2002	Mrs Miriam LAU	NO
2002	Tommy CHEUNG	NO

Appendix D: The voting records of motion on Minimum Wage Bill in 2010 and political affiliations of the selected lawmakers

投票 VOTE: 25
 日期 DATE: 17/07/2010
 時間 TIME: 06:24:33 上午am
 動議 MOTION: 《最低工資條例草案》- 三讀
 MINIMUM WAGE BILL - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 勞工及福利局局長 Secretary for Labour and Welfare

出席 Present :47
 投票 Vote :46
 贊成 Yes :45
 反對 No :1
 棄權 Abstain :0
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何耀泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	梁家驊	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG			黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him		
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	謝偉俊	Paul TSE	反對	NO
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES
余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN		
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man		

秘書 CLERK

Political Affiliations of the selected lawmakers in 2010

DP		
Year	Name	Voting Record
2010	Albert HO	YES
2010	Fred LI	YES
2010	James TO	YES
2010	CHEUNG Man-kwong	YES
2010	Emily LAU	YES
2010	Andrew CHENG	ABSENT
2010	LEE Wing-tat	YES
2010	KAM Nai-wai	YES
2010	WONG Sing-chi	YES

LP		
Year	Name	Voting Record
2010	Miriam LAU	YES
2010	Tommy CHEUNG	YES
2010	Vincent FANG	ABSENT

Appendix E: The coding sheet of this paper

Article Title:

Date:

Newspapers: Apple Daily HK Economic Journal Ming Pao Daily News

Remarks:

Positive Portrayals:

P1. Creating a safety net for low-skilled laborers

P2. Facilitating the economic development

P3. Benefiting all workers in society

Negative Portrayals:

N1. Affecting the economic development

N2. Leading to an increase in the unemployment rate

N3. Affecting the self-adjustment mechanism of the market

Neutral Portrayals:

NEU1. Including a same distribution of positive and negative arguments about SMW

NEU2. Description of the statistics of SMW

NEU3. Description of the operational terms of SMW

Others Portrayals:

O1. Discussing a SMW in the context of foreign domestic workers in Hong Kong

O2. Focusing on the discussion of other issues

O3. Discussing a SMW in foreign countries

Appendix F: Statutory Minimum Wage portrayal total in AD, MP and HKEJ

SMW Portrayal Totals in AD, MP & HKEJ									
Year	Positive	Percentage	Negative	Percentage	Neutral	Percentage	Others	Percentage	Total
1998	1	9.09%	3	27.27%	3	27.27%	4	36.36%	11
1999	9	11.69%	10	12.99%	21	27.27%	37	48.05%	77
2000	34	39.08%	16	18.39%	13	14.94%	24	27.59%	87
2001	21	20.19%	3	2.88%	19	18.27%	61	58.65%	104
2002	6	9.68%	6	9.68%	8	12.90%	42	67.74%	62
2003	4	5.63%	3	4.23%	5	7.04%	59	83.10%	71
2004	34	23.13%	33	22.45%	23	15.65%	57	38.78%	147
2005	41	15.59%	30	11.41%	52	19.77%	140	53.23%	263
2006	78	17.11%	70	15.35%	57	12.50%	251	55.04%	456
2007	67	18.06%	51	13.75%	68	18.33%	185	49.87%	371
2008	75	18.38%	50	12.25%	70	17.16%	213	52.21%	408
2009	53	19.63%	32	11.85%	25	9.26%	160	59.26%	270
2010	90	20.59%	40	9.15%	83	18.99%	224	51.26%	437
Total	513	-	347	-	447	-	1457		2764

Appendix G: Statutory Minimum Wage portrayal totals in AD, MP & HKEJ

SMW Portrayal Totals in AD, MP & HKEJ					
	Positive	Percentage	Negative	Percentage	Total
1998	1	25.00%	3	75.00%	4
1999	9	47.37%	10	52.63%	19
2000	34	68.00%	16	32.00%	50
2001	21	87.50%	3	12.50%	24
2002	6	50.00%	6	50.00%	12
2003	4	57.14%	3	42.86%	7
2004	34	50.75%	33	49.25%	67
2005	41	57.75%	30	42.25%	71
2006	78	52.70%	70	47.30%	148
2007	67	56.78%	51	43.22%	118
2008	75	60.00%	50	40.00%	125
2009	53	62.35%	32	37.65%	85
2010	90	69.23%	40	30.77%	130
Total	513	-	347	-	860

Appendix H: Top three themes overall

Top Three Themes Overall										
Year	1st	Occurrences	Percentage	2nd	Occurrences	Percentage	3rd	Occurrences	Percentage	Portrayal Totals
1998	O2	4	44.44%	NEU1	3	33.33%	N3	2	22.22%	9
1999	O2	32	54.24%	NEU1	21	35.59%	N2	6	10.17%	59
2000	O2	24	40.00%	P1	23	38.33%	NEU1	13	21.67%	60
2001	O2	49	60.49%	NEU1	19	23.46%	P1	13	16.05%	81
2002	O2	27	55.10%	O1	14	28.57%	NEU1	8	16.33%	49
2003	O2	30	47.62%	O1	28	44.44%	NEU1	5	7.94%	63
2004	O2	51	54.26%	NEU1	23	24.47%	P1	20	21.28%	94
2005	O2	124	62.31%	NEU1	52	26.13%	P1	23	11.56%	199
2006	O2	227	68.37%	NEU1	57	17.17%	P1	48	14.46%	332
2007	O2	169	61.90%	NEU1	68	24.91%	P1	36	13.19%	273
2008	O2	183	63.99%	NEU1	70	24.48%	P1	33	11.54%	286
2009	O2	132	70.97%	P3	28	15.05%	O1	26	13.98%	186
2010	O2	205	63.86%	NEU1	83	25.86%	P3	33	10.28%	321

Appendix I: The details information about the coding, and the distribution about the patterns (in themes) used by the selected newspapers to portray SMW in the post-colonial Hong Kong, are shown below

Year	NEU1	NEU2	NEU3	O1	O2	O3	P1	P2	P3	N1	N2	N3	Total
1998	3	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	2	11
1999	21	0	0	5	32	0	5	1	3	2	6	2	77
2000	13	0	0	0	24	0	23	4	7	4	5	7	87
2001	19	0	0	12	49	0	13	2	6	0	0	3	104
2002	8	0	0	14	27	1	4	1	1	0	2	4	62
2003	5	0	0	28	30	1	2	1	1	0	2	1	71
2004	23	0	0	2	51	4	20	4	10	3	14	16	147
2005	52	0	0	8	124	8	23	6	12	8	8	14	263
2006	57	0	0	9	227	15	48	5	25	5	18	47	456
2007	68	0	0	7	169	9	36	12	19	7	17	27	371
2008	70	0	0	18	183	12	33	16	26	13	13	24	408
2009	25	0	0	26	132	2	10	15	28	5	6	21	270
2010	83	0	0	3	205	16	25	32	33	12	10	18	437
Total	447	0	0	136	1253	68	242	99	172	59	102	186	2764